

Committees:	Dates:	Item no.
Streets and Walkways Sub-Committee Projects Sub-Committee	24 November 2017 11 December 2017	
Subject: City wayfinding signage review	Gateway 3/4 Detailed Options Appraisal (Regular)	Public
Report of: Director of the Built Environment		For Decision

Summary

Dashboard:

- (i) Project status: Green
- (ii) Timeline: Gateway 3/4
- (iii) Project estimated cost: £3.2M
- (iv) Spend to date: £103,876 from a budget of £125,000 (staff costs and fees). It is estimated that £435,000 is required to progress the project to gateway 5.
- (v) Overall project risk: Low

This report summarises the findings of the City wayfinding signage review. It details the options appraisal undertaken by consultants Applied Wayfinding and makes recommendations for the future of wayfinding in the City of London Corporation (City Corporation).

Progress to date

In April 2016, the Planning and Transportation Committee and the Projects Sub-Committee approved a Gateway 1 & 2 project proposal for a City wayfinding signage review. The review was considered necessary as the existing City wayfinding system has not kept pace with the constantly evolving street scene and because of initiatives that will bring more visitors into the City such as Crossrail and Culture Mile.

A working party was established comprising both internal and external stakeholders. The working party's remit was to set the review's objectives, input in to the development of the project brief and oversee the review once consultants had been appointed. The review brief sought suitably experienced consultants to assess a range of wayfinding options and recommend a system that is fit for purpose now and in the future.

Applied Wayfinding were appointed to undertake the review in March 2017 and a final recommendations report was approved by the working party in August 2017.

Recommendation

It is recommended that Members approve the proposals to:

- Introduce Legible London as the core wayfinding system in the City of London to improve the experience of walking in the Square Mile;
- Progress the scheme development phase to inform the gateway 5 report;
- Work with internal and external stakeholders to promote existing - and develop new - digital wayfinding products;
- Promote awareness of the benefits of cues & clues that can assist intuitive wayfinding and placemaking, particularly in visitor destinations such as Culture Mile.

Overview of options

Applied Wayfinding (AW) was tasked with assessing a range of different options as part of the review. The options were:

- Do Nothing;
- Update the existing static City signage;
- Replace the existing static signage with a digital system;
- Use of “cues & clues” - such as artwork or bespoke lighting - to assist with wayfinding;
- Modify the existing City signage to incorporate the Legible London system widely used in the rest of London;
- Migrate fully to the Legible London system.

The working party played a valuable role during the course of the review, providing helpful local insight across a wide range of disciplines and interests. A full list is included as Appendix A.

Between April and July, the working party took part in three workshop sessions led by AW. These focussed on AW’s initial research and insights findings; an assessment of different wayfinding systems and tools; and a review of Future/Smart City technology. At the final workshop AW presented their assessment of the various options and recommendations for the future of wayfinding in the City. The research and insights report is included as Appendix B and a copy can be viewed in the Members’ Library or obtained by contacting the report author.

Options appraisal

Applied Wayfinding used thirteen criteria and sub-criteria to evaluate each option. As part of the evaluation process, it was acknowledged that if cost were no option then any option could potentially be made to work. AW used an evaluation system whereby each option was assessed against a series of achievable and realistic outcomes. The options criteria were graded as either positive and achievable or negative/problematic. The criteria were then combined to give an overall score.

An independent accessibility review of the City’s existing wayfinding system was also undertaken as part of the full review and included in the evaluation. The accessibility consultant met with the City of London Access Group to get resident and worker insights and travelled around the City. Of the City’s current wayfinding system the review says it “does not reflect access best practice: the font (Albertus), text colours and size are not optimum for visibility and legibility.”

The recommendations report is included as Appendix C and a copy can be viewed in the Members’ Library or obtained by contacting the report author. A summary of the route options evaluation matrix is shown overleaf:

		Option 1	Option 2	Option 3	Option 4	Option 5	Option 6
		Do nothing	Update existing	Digital	Cues & clues	Legible London hybrid	Legible London
Criteria	Sub-criteria						
Cost	Short term	✓	x	x	x	x	x
	Long term	✓	x	✓	✓	✓	✓
Maintenance	Physical object	x	x	x	✓	x	✓
	Content	x	x	✓	✓	✓	✓
Management		x	✓	✓	✓	x	✓
Flexibility		x	x	✓	x	x	✓
Identity		x	x	x	✓	x	x
Strategy		x	x	x	x	x	✓
Accessibility	City currently	x	x	x	x	x	✓
	Opportunity	x	x	✓	✓	x	✓
Sustainability	Physical implementation	✓	x	✓	✓	x	✓
Integration		x	x	✓	x	✓	✓
Impact on visitor experience		x	✓	✓	x	✓	✓
Score		23% ✓	15% ✓	62% ✓	54% ✓	31% ✓	85% ✓
		77% x	85% x	38% x	46% x	69% x	15% x

The wayfinding review recommends a combination of option 3 (Digital), option 4 (cues & clues) and option 6 (Legible London) are progressed. The recommendation is for Legible London to form the core method of wayfinding for the City, with complementary wayfinding tools being provided using digital products and cues and clues, where appropriate. The review notes that as “the primary focus is to improve the on-street pedestrian experience” the introduction of Legible London “should be the priority”.

The three recommended options provide opportunities to develop a co-ordinated pedestrian wayfinding system comprising inclusive signage, digital technology, real time and pre-visit information that better meets the access needs of all pedestrians using the City’s streets.

Proposed way forward

Legible London

Legible London is a multiple award-winning wayfinding system developed by Transport for London to support walking and cycling journeys around London. Legible London is recognised as a global leader in wayfinding. New York City's Transportation Commissioner has described it as the 'gold standard for wayfinding research and design'. The Legible London design has been adopted across the world by local government, transport authorities, private companies, landowners, business improvement districts and other stakeholders with an interest in providing better wayfinding information.

Legible London is designed to provide a consistent visual language and wayfinding system across the Capital, allowing visitors and local residents to easily gain local geographic knowledge regardless of the area they are in. Legible London is fully integrated into the wider transport network. In addition to on-street signs, Legible London maps appear in all underground stations, at Docklands Light Railway stations, on bus shelters and at cycle hire docking stations. The Legible London product range is included as Appendix D

A static, on-street presence in the form of maps and directional maps – when done well - provides a welcoming civic voice and will show that the City cares about its visitors. Legible London has an authority and a simplicity that is easy to trust and requires relatively little effort to use. It is also more democratic than a digital interface that some users struggle with. A static system helps to filter out the environment for the user and identify key destinations. This will be particularly effective in somewhere as dense as the City of London where line of sight (or legibility of the environment) is greatly reduced.

All the boroughs around the City have now adopted the Legible London system and it is already in use in the Square Mile at bus stops, underground stations and cycle hire docking stations. Adoption by the City will ensure that people walking in and around the Square Mile benefit from a seamless and consistent wayfinding experience. This is particularly important for visitors who will not be aware of administrative boundaries and, unlike Legible London, the City's current maps do not generally extend beyond the boundaries of the Square Mile.

Legible London encourages people to walk as maps inform users what can be reached within a five and a 15 minute walk and reduce concerns about getting lost. Analysis by TfL has found that there are over 75,000 journeys a day in the City of London that could potentially be walked but are currently made by motorised modes of transport.

Legible London will support the City to deliver outcomes of the draft Corporate Plan by ensuring the City is physically well-connected, people are safe and feel safe and enjoy good health and wellbeing; something that walking is known to improve. It will help deliver a key objective of the City's draft Cultural Strategy; "better wayfinding". Due to the economies of scale achieved by being a pan-London system, the on-going maintenance costs of Legible London will be considerably cheaper than the current system (specific examples of this are detailed in section 10 of the Main Report).

Legible London will also help meet key objectives of the Mayor of London's draft Transport Strategy that states the Mayor, through working with London local authorities "will make it easier for people to walk and cycle in London by:

- Maintaining, expanding and improving 'Legible London' pedestrian wayfinding maps and ensuring that on-street cycle network signage is clear and consistent.
- Using new data to develop and improve online journey planning and navigation tools that will make walking and cycling trips the most easy journeys to plan."

To progress the move to the Legible London wayfinding system and inform a gateway 5 report, the following activities need to take place:

- Citywide audit of the existing City and adjacent borough Legible London wayfinding systems to inform pedestrian route network, sign placement and content plans (to include an assessment of the retention of existing City fingerpost infrastructure where necessary);
- Legible London basemap review;
- Production of sign placement plan, sign content and de-clutter schedules;
- Production of signage artwork
- Submission of sign placement plan/content schedule to obtain scheme estimate. Estimate from highways term contractor for clutter removal;
- Composite estimate to introduce Legible London for gateway 5 report.

Digital

The wayfinding review concluded that a digital on-street system is not practical. In contrast to a static system, a digital interface becomes locked into a single user request once in use, whereas a static system can be used by multiple users at the same time. In addition, the review suggests that people tend to digest information on a static map more easily than its digital format and, crucially, information gleaned from a static map is more likely to be retained for future reference.

The review however outlines a number of digital products that could be developed to complement the Legible London system. Digital is best applied to personal tools such as smartphones or personal computers or for specific applications such as buying tickets. A current example of this is the City Toilet Finder App that enables people to locate the nearest available toilet. This App. could be further developed to include other useful destinations.

Digital kiosks/screens work well in controlled environments such as visitor centres, libraries and foyers. The following digital initiatives could be progressed to complement the Legible London static system:

- Promote TfL's digital service in office/hotel foyers that provides live travel information on TV screens. The service is free if there a screen available and can encourage people to think about alternative modes of transport including cycling and walking. The screens could also include information about air quality, local events and highlight alternative walking routes and green spaces.
- As part of the City's Future Cities initiative, work with TfL to research and develop digital wayfinding opportunities. This could potentially lead to a trial of a Legible London digital tool in the City of London and the piloting of wayfinding

systems that assist people with access needs.

- Should TfL adopt a digital Legible London base map, many opportunities will be opened up to use digital mapping that is consistent with the static system to promote bespoke tools such as historical walks, step-free routes, wayfinding in Culture Mile and alternative routes during construction works.

Cues and clues

Cues and clues can take multiple forms, from a discrete object, to the bespoke treatment of a large area such as Exhibition Road, to a series of themed interventions such as those being developed for the City's Lighting Strategy. Whilst cues and clues can be effective in enhancing the environment and provide memorable placemaking cues, they do not inherently communicate detailed information. For this reason, they provide a supporting element rather than a stand-alone wayfinding solution.

Cues and clues are expected to play an important role in Culture Mile's Look and Feel Strategy and several projects are being developed including colourful crossings, artwork, installations and bespoke lighting. The opportunities for the City are only limited by imagination but too many interventions can introduce clutter and lose their intention or impact. Cues and clues therefore need to be coordinated and this is probably best managed through the City's Area Strategies.

Financial implications

To date, the City has incurred total costs of £103,876 out of a current budget of £125,000. The further scheme development required to progress the project to gateway 5 is estimated to cost £435,000.

Main report		
<i>Proposal</i>		
1. Brief description	The City of London wayfinding review has assessed a range of options for the future of wayfinding in the City and has recommended that the Legible London system is adopted throughout the Square Mile. The introduction of Legible London will greatly improve the experience for visitors to the City and will be of great benefit to visitor-led initiatives such as Culture Mile. This phase of the project will deliver the sign placement plan, sign content, clutter audit, artwork and a detailed estimate for the construction phase.	
2. Scope and exclusions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Legible London will be introduced across the whole of the City of London but will be restricted to the public highway and City walkways. • The proposals do not cover areas of private land but private landowners are able to introduce Legible London by contracting directly with Transport for London. 	
<i>Project Planning</i>		
3. Programme and key dates	Task	Target date
	Procurement of consultants to produce Citywide Legible London sign placement plan, content schedule and clutter audit.	January-April 2018
	Agreement of maintenance plan to ensure new signage is regularly updated and properly maintained.	September 2018
	Production of sign placement plan, content schedule and clutter audit.	June 2018-May 2019
	Production of estimate for Citywide installation of Legible London.	June 2019
	Gateway 5 report	July 2019
	Commence the phased installation of Citywide Legible London wayfinding system.	September 2019

<p>4. Risk implications</p>	<p>A key risk is the reputational damage to the City if it does not move to make its wayfinding system fit for purpose:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The existing system contains out of date information and is not being maintained; • The existing system does not reflect access best practice for visibility and legibility; • The City risks failing to fully comply with its equality duty where signage does not conform to access best practice. <p>The implications of not moving to Legible London include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Not creating a welcoming environment for visitors to the City who may have experienced - and become familiar with - Legible London in the boroughs that border the City. • The City not contributing to the draft “Mayor’s Transport Strategy” objective of “maintaining, expanding and improving ‘Legible London’ pedestrian wayfinding maps and ensuring that on-street cycle network signage is clear and consistent”. <p>An implication of moving to the Legible London system is that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The City will no longer have full control of its wayfinding base map. TfL is the custodian of Legible London and have clear asset selection criteria for inclusion on the base map. N.B. The City is able to submit requests to TfL for amendments to the base map and these are assessed against the asset selection criteria. To date, most requests for amendments have been accepted by TfL
<p>5. Benefits and disbenefits</p>	<p>These are comprehensively assessed in the review recommendations report. Please see options appraisal above and Appendix C for further information.</p>
<p>6. Stakeholders and consultees</p>	<p>The working party established for the wayfinding review will be re-convened to oversee and input in to the scheme development phase. Its membership will be reviewed and could be expanded to include representatives of the Cheapside BID and Crossrail.</p>
<p>Resource Implications</p>	
<p>7. Total Estimated cost</p>	<p>Scheme development to gateway 5: £435,000 Installation cost estimate: £3.2 million</p>
<p>8. Funding strategy</p>	<p>Local Implementation Plan (LIP) funding will be used to fund the scheme development phase and progress the project to gateway 5. This will comprise £315,000 from the 2018/19 allocation and £120,000 from the 2019/20 allocation.</p> <p>Further LIP funding has been provisionally allocated in future years to fund a phased approach to the installation of Legible London. If a funding bid for DBE CIL was successful, the project could be completed more quickly. Funding may also become available for the installation phase via specific Section 106 contributions.</p>

9. Estimated capital value/return	Not applicable.
10. Ongoing revenue implications	<p>The existing City wayfinding system was introduced in 2006/07 and has not kept pace with the constantly evolving street scene. An update of the existing maps is estimated to cost over £200,000, notwithstanding the access review conclusion that the current style of mapping does not reflect best practice for visibility or legibility. This figure does not include City finger posts which account for over 150 extra signs.</p> <p>The wayfinding review included an evaluation of both short term and long term costs for each option and the long term cost implications of adopting Legible London were assessed as positive. Compared to the existing system, Legible London system will be much cheaper to maintain:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Legible London base map is continually updated at no cost to participating local authorities, whereas a small revision to the artwork of one City map costs approximately £120; • Access to the pan-London TfL framework contract and resultant economies of scale keep Legible London product costs low; • The cost to replace an existing City map is £1368.00, whereas the cost to replace a Legible London base map is £162 - a reduction of £1,206; • A four slat City finger post costs £6,652, whereas a four slat Legible London finger post costs £1315 - a reduction of £5,337; • A typical City Monolith costs £7988, whereas a Legible London Monolith costs £3.485 - a reduction of £4,503. <p>A maintenance plan will be produced and summarised in the gateway 5 report.</p>
11. Investment appraisal	Please see Appendices B and C for further information.
12. Affordability	The a detailed cost estimate for the recommended option will be produced as part of the proposed next phase of work and will be confirmed at gateway 5,
13. Procurement strategy	<p>To progress the project to gateway 5: all consultancy work commissioned for the audit of the existing Legible London wayfinding systems in the City, the production of sign placement plan, sign content and de-clutter schedules will be procured by the City through City Procurement.</p> <p>For the installation phase: The City is able to utilise framework contracts via Transport for London for the production of detailed mapping artwork and the supply and installation of the Legible London signage. The City's highway term contractor, JB Riney,</p>

	will undertake the removal of redundant signage.		
14. Legal implications	<p>In its role as highway authority, the City must have regard to its duty: assert and protect the rights of the public to the use and enjoyment of the highway; and to secure the expeditious, convenient and safe movement of traffic, including pedestrians.</p> <p>The City must also have regard to the public sector equality duty in exercising its functions under the Equality Act 2010.</p>		
15. Corporate property implications	There are no known corporate property implications at this time.		
16. Traffic implications	The introduction of Legible London signage across the City of London will make it easier for people to walk and cycle in the City and will make a positive contribution to the City's Active Travel programme.		
17. Sustainability and energy implications	It is anticipated that all material will be sustainability sourced where possible and suitably durable for the life of the asset.		
18. IS implications	There are no known IS implications at this time.		
<i>Recommended option</i>			
19. Equality Analysis	An Equality Analysis will be carried out.		
20. <u>Recommendation</u>	The wayfinding review recommends a combination of option 3 (Digital), option 4 (cues & clues) and option 6 (Legible London) are progressed. The recommendation is for Legible London to form the core method of wayfinding for the City, with complementary wayfinding tools being provided using digital products and cues and clues, where appropriate.		
21. Next Gateway	Gateway 5 – Authority to start work.		
22. Resource requirements to reach next Gateway	It is estimated that £435,000 is required to reach gateway 5:		
	Item	Description	Estimated cost (£)
	Fees	Production of sign placement plan, content schedule, clutter audit and artwork.	350,000
	Works costs	Trial holes and site surveys	20,000
	Staff costs	City Transportation: Project Management	47,000
		City Public Realm: project partner	3,000
		Highways: coordination of trial holes/site surveys	15,000
	Total		435,000

Appendices

Appendix A	City wayfinding review working party members
Appendix B	Research and insights report (review copy in Members' Library or please contact report author)
Appendix C	Recommendations report (review copy in Members' Library or please contact report author)
Appendix D	Legible London product range

Report history

Gateway 1 & 2	Approved at Planning & Transportation 5 April 2016; approved at Projects sub-committee 13 April 2016.
--------------------------	---

Contact

Report Author	George Wright
Email Address	George.Wright@cityoflondon.gov.uk
Telephone Number	07802 378812